

NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANISATION



RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION

BP 25, 7 RUE ANCELLE, F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX, FRANCE

RTO MEETING PROCEEDINGS 69(II)

Low Cost Composite Structures

(Les structures composites à bas coût)

and

Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms

(La mise en œuvre rentable des alliages de titane dans les plates-formes militaires)

Papers presented at the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT) Specialists' Meeting held in Loen, Norway, 7-11 May 2001.



This page has been deliberately left blank



Page intentionnellement blanche

NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANISATION



RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION

BP 25, 7 RUE ANCELLE, F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX, FRANCE

RTO MEETING PROCEEDINGS 69(II)

Low Cost Composite Structures

(Les structures composites à bas coût)

and

Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms

(La mise en œuvre rentable des alliages de titane dans les plates-formes militaires)

Papers presented at the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT) Specialists' Meeting held in Loen, Norway, 7-11 May 2001.



The Research and Technology Organisation (RTO) of NATO

RTO is the single focus in NATO for Defence Research and Technology activities. Its mission is to conduct and promote cooperative research and information exchange. The objective is to support the development and effective use of national defence research and technology and to meet the military needs of the Alliance, to maintain a technological lead, and to provide advice to NATO and national decision makers. The RTO performs its mission with the support of an extensive network of national experts. It also ensures effective coordination with other NATO bodies involved in R&T activities.

RTO reports both to the Military Committee of NATO and to the Conference of National Armament Directors. It comprises a Research and Technology Board (RTB) as the highest level of national representation and the Research and Technology Agency (RTA), a dedicated staff with its headquarters in Neuilly, near Paris, France. In order to facilitate contacts with the military users and other NATO activities, a small part of the RTA staff is located in NATO Headquarters in Brussels. The Brussels staff also coordinates RTO's cooperation with nations in Middle and Eastern Europe, to which RTO attaches particular importance especially as working together in the field of research is one of the more promising areas of initial cooperation.

The total spectrum of R&T activities is covered by the following 7 bodies:

- AVT Applied Vehicle Technology Panel
- HFM Human Factors and Medicine Panel
- IST Information Systems Technology Panel
- NMSG NATO Modelling and Simulation Group
- SAS Studies, Analysis and Simulation Panel
- SCI Systems Concepts and Integration Panel
- SET Sensors and Electronics Technology Panel

These bodies are made up of national representatives as well as generally recognised 'world class' scientists. They also provide a communication link to military users and other NATO bodies. RTO's scientific and technological work is carried out by Technical Teams, created for specific activities and with a specific duration. Such Technical Teams can organise workshops, symposia, field trials, lecture series and training courses. An important function of these Technical Teams is to ensure the continuity of the expert networks.

RTO builds upon earlier cooperation in defence research and technology as set-up under the Advisory Group for Aerospace Research and Development (AGARD) and the Defence Research Group (DRG). AGARD and the DRG share common roots in that they were both established at the initiative of Dr Theodore von Kármán, a leading aerospace scientist, who early on recognised the importance of scientific support for the Allied Armed Forces. RTO is capitalising on these common roots in order to provide the Alliance and the NATO nations with a strong scientific and technological basis that will guarantee a solid base for the future.

The content of this publication has been reproduced directly from material supplied by RTO or the authors.

Published March 2003

Copyright © RTO/NATO 2003
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 92-837-0026-0



*Printed by St. Joseph Print Group Inc.
(A St. Joseph Corporation Company)
1165 Kenaston Street, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1G 6S1*

Low Cost Composite Structures

(RTO MP-069(II) / AVT-076)

Executive Summary

The development of military systems that utilise composite materials for their structures has continued to increase, but one of the factors which still limits their applicability is their cost, compared to metallic systems. Composites have demonstrated in both the land, sea and air environments that their use can substantially reduce the weight and consequently increase the performance of military equipment. Composite may also offer maintenance cost reduction due to their better corrosion and fatigue properties. But, as defence budgets continue to decline in real terms, the cost of new equipment is becoming increasingly important, to the detriment of potentially increased capability.

The objective of this Specialists' Meeting was to explore the recent advances in the design and manufacture composite structures for military systems to identify both common themes and unique differences between the services and how each in addressing the requirement for reduced cost.

The drawing together of representatives from all three environments (air, sea and land) was a rather unique feature of the meeting, which contributed to both the high levels of interest of the papers and exchange of ideas during the discussions.

A total of 21 papers were presented with authors representing 11 member countries. It was felt by many of attendees of the meeting that the meeting's emphasis on products and lessons learnt from producing hardware, rather than pure scientific research, was one of the key factors that contributed to the success of the meeting.

Les structures composites à bas coût

(RTO MP-069(II) / AVT-076)

Synthèse

Le développement des systèmes militaires utilisant les structures composites a continué à croître, mais un des facteurs qui limite toujours leur application est leur coût, comparé aux systèmes métalliques. Les composites ont démontré dans les environnements terrestres, marins et aériens que leur utilisation peut réduire substantiellement les poids et en conséquence accroître les performances des équipements militaires. Les composites peuvent aussi apporter des réductions de coûts de maintenance par leur meilleure tenue en corrosion et en fatigue. Mais comme les budgets de défense continuent à décroître en termes réels, le coût des équipements nouveaux devient de plus en plus le point important, au détriment de l'accroissement possible des capacités.

L'objectif de cette réunion des spécialistes était d'explorer les progrès récents dans la conception et la fabrication de structures composites pour les systèmes militaires, pour identifier à la fois les thèmes communs et les différences uniques entre les services et la façon dont chacun aborde l'exigence de coûts réduits.

La réunion de représentants des trois environnements (air, mer et terre) était une caractéristique plutôt unique de ce meeting, qui a contribué à la fois au haut niveau d'intérêt des présentations et des échanges d'idées pendant les discussions.

Un total de 21 papiers a été présenté par des auteurs représentant 11 pays membres. Il a été ressenti par beaucoup des participants de ce meeting que l'orientation vers les produits et l'expérience acquise en produisant les structures, plus que vers la pure recherche scientifique, était un des facteurs clé qui ont contribué au succès de ce meeting.

Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms

(RTO MP-069(II) / AVT-077)

Executive Summary

Titanium alloys offer major weight and performance benefits for military platforms due to their combination of lightweight, corrosion resistance and high temperature capabilities. The meeting provided a successful forum for information exchange and discussions by specialists on the cost-effective application of titanium alloys to air, land and sea platforms. While the development of titanium alloys and processing technology, such as casting, superplastic forming and diffusion bonding, is relatively mature, the application of titanium and its alloys in military systems depends on several factors, the primary one being cost.

Twenty presentations from 9 countries discussed titanium extraction, casting technology, component fabrication, use for ballistic protection, and applications in platform subsystems. The attendees concluded that reducing costs associated with the insertion of titanium and its alloys into military systems requires that all aspects of processing, design and manufacturing are addressed. Modeling can have a significant impact on total cost, starting with that associated with reducing defects in castings, through to finite element modeling of processing, e.g. extrusion and forging. Modeling of microstructure/property relationship also reduces the number of tests required for qualification of new materials and allows more accurate life predictions. Advanced computational and manufacturing technologies and development of methods for assessing properties from a design confidence point of view can reduce costs and increase the usage of titanium and its alloys in military systems.

The application of new processing and design technologies is expected to reduce the cost of titanium component significantly. This will lead to far wider application of titanium alloys in military systems and the military operator will benefit from increased performance with through life cost savings relative to more traditional metallic structures.

La mise en œuvre rentable des alliages de titane dans les plates-formes militaires

(RTO MP-069(II) / AVT-077)

Synthèse

Les alliages de titane offrent des avantages majeurs de poids et de performances pour les plates-formes militaires dus à la combinaison de leurs caractéristiques de légèreté, de résistance à la corrosion et de haute résistance à chaud. La réunion fut l'occasion d'un forum réussi pour des échanges d'information et des discussions entre spécialistes au sujet de l'utilisation rentable d'alliages de titane dans des plates-formes terrestres, aériennes et maritimes. Alors que le développement des alliages de titane et des technologies de transformation comme le coulage, le formage superplastique et l'assemblage par diffusion, est relativement mature, l'utilisation du titane et de ses alliages dans les systèmes militaires dépend de plusieurs facteurs, principalement le coût.

Vingt présentations faites par 9 pays ont traité de l'extraction du titane de la technologie du coulage, de la fabrication des composants, de l'utilisation pour la protection balistique, et des applications aux sous-systèmes de plate-forme. Les participants ont conclu que la réduction des coûts associée à l'insertion du titane et de ses alliages dans les systèmes militaires nécessite que tous les aspects de la transformation, de la conception et de la fabrication soient abordés. La modélisation peut avoir un impact important sur le coût total, en commençant par la réduction des défauts dans les pièces coulées, en passant par la modélisation par éléments finis du procédé de transformation, par exemple l'extrusion et le forgeage. La modélisation de la relation microstructure/propriétés réduit aussi le nombre d'essais nécessaires pour la qualification des nouveaux matériaux et permet des prévisions plus précises. Les technologies de fabrication et d'informatique avancées et le développement des méthodes d'évaluation des propriétés du point de vue de la fiabilité de conception peuvent réduire les coûts et augmenter l'utilisation du titane et de ses alliages dans les systèmes militaires.

On peut s'attendre à ce que l'utilisation de nouvelles technologies de conception et de transformation réduise le coût des pièces en titane de façon importante. Ceci permettra une utilisation plus large des alliages de titane dans les systèmes militaires et l'exploitant militaire bénéficiera d'une augmentation des performances associée à des économies sur le coût du cycle de vie par rapport aux structures métalliques plus traditionnelles.

Contents

| | Page |
|--|------|
| Executive Summary (Low Cost Composite Structures) | iii |
| Synthèse (Les structures composites à bas coût) | iv |
| Executive Summary (Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms) | v |
| Synthèse (La mise en œuvre rentable des alliages de titane dans les plates-formes militaires) | vi |
| Publications of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel | xi |
| Programme Committees | xiii |

Reference

SPECIALISTS' MEETING - LOW COST COMPOSITE STRUCTURES

| | |
|--|----|
| Technical Evaluation Report by M. French | T1 |
|--|----|

SESSION I: APPLICATIONS

| | |
|---|---|
| Low-Cost Composite Materials and Structures for Aircraft Applications by R.B. Deo, J.H. Starnes Jr. and R.C. Holzwarth | 1 |
| Les matériaux composites en construction navale militaire (Composite Materials in Warship Construction) by P. Parneix, J.Y. Le Lan and D. Lucas | 2 |
| Composite Materials & New Modelling Techniques for Lighter AFVs by M.A. French | 3 |
| Design and Certification of a Vacuum-Assisted Resin Transfer Moulded Composite Seaplane Float by G. Wood, L. Petrescue and A. Johnston | 4 |
| Paper 5 withdrawn | |
| Increasing Productivity in Composite Manufacturing by J. Bauer | 6 |
| Manufacture of an Helicopter Structure with Resin Transfer Moulding by E. Anamateros, A. Leone, R. Severoni, N. Cioeta and M. Marchetti | 7 |
| An Affordable Methodology for Replacing Metallic Aircraft Panels with Advanced Composite Materials by A.A. Baker, P.J. Callus, K.H. Leong, S. Georgiadis, P.J. Falzon and S.E. Dutton | 8 |
| A Heavy Duty Composite Bridge Made of Glass/Polyester Pultruded Box Beams by V. Kostopoulos, Y.P. Markopoulos, D.E. Vlachos, C. Galiotis and N.E. Melanitis | 9 |

Paper 10 withdrawn

GRP in Naval Applications. Possibilities and Production Aspects 11
by J. Taby, A. Hjelmseth and B. Høyning

SESSION II: MATERIALS AND MANUFACTURING

LTM® – A Flexible Processing Technology for Polymer Composite Structures 12
by R. Francombe

Electron Beam Processing for Operational Sustainment of Ageing Aircraft 13
by V.J. Lopata, A. Puzianowski, L. Biggin, L. Petrescue, A. Johnston and D. Raizenne

A Study of Aeronautical Components for Optimisation of Curing Parameters 14
by A. Battaglino, E. Anamateros, L. Amantini, F. Compagno, A.V. Lombardi and
M. Marchetti

Achieving Low Cost Composite Processes through Intelligent Design and Control 15
by S.M. Walsh and B.K. Fink

**Mechanical Characterisation of Carbon/Epoxy Composite Materials Manufactured by
Resin Film Infusion Method with Stitching Reinforcement** 16
by F. Blas and L. Fernández

Composite Structures and Materials Research at NASA Langley Research Center 17
by J.H. Starnes Jr., H.B. Dexter, N.J. Johnston, D.R. Ambur and R.J. Cano

Study of the Deepdrawing Process of Technical Textile Reinforced Thermoplastics 18
by L. Bogaerts, M. Lossie and D. Vandepitte

Aeronautical Composite Structure Cost Reduction from the Material Aspect 19
by J. Cinquin

**Advanced Textile Technologies for the Cost Effective Manufacturing of High Performance
Composites** 20
by J. Brandt, K. Drechsler and J. Filsinger

Novel Toughening Mechanisms for Low Cost Composite Structures 21
by P.J. Hogg and F.C. Smith

**Simulation Based Low-Cost Composite Process Development at the US Air Force
Research Laboratory** 22
by B.P. Rice, C.W. Lee and D.B. Curliss

Thermoplastic Tape Placement and Continuous Consolidation 23
by D. Lang, S. Barre, C. Coiffier-Colas and H. Sibois

**SPECIALISTS' MEETING -
COST EFFECTIVE APPLICATION OF TITANIUM ALLOYS
IN MILITARY PLATFORMS**

| | |
|--|------------|
| Technical Evaluation Report by E. Starke | T2 |
| Cost Effective Use of Materials for Military Systems – from Design to Disposal by P. Price and D. Rugg | KN1 |
| Improving Affordability of Titanium by R. Thomas | KN2 |

SESSION I: CASTING TECHNOLOGY FOR TITANIUM ALLOY COMPONENTS

| | |
|--|----------|
| Applications, Benefits, and Implementation of Ti-6Al-4V Castings by E.W. Lee, C.S.C. Lei and W.E. Frazier | 1 |
| Manufacture of Titanium Alloy Components for Aerospace and Military Applications by P.J. Bridges and B. Magnus | 2 |
| Investment Cast Titanium for Aeroengine and Aircraft Structural Applications by S. Veeck and J. Klepeisz | 3 |
| Fatigue Evaluation of Titanium Investment Casting by M. Ciprandi and A. Turri | 4 |
| Application of Structural Titanium Castings on the USAF F-22 Raptor by J.F. Gonzalez and L.P. Perkins | 5 |

SESSION II: COMPONENT FABRICATION PROCESSES

| | |
|--|-------------|
| New Low Cost Titanium Extraction and Processing by M. Ward-Close | KN3† |
| Ti Component Design and Production for Reduced Life Cycle Costs by D. Rugg | 6 |
| Cold Forming of Beta Titanium Sheet by R. Lang, K. Hofmann and H. Gese | 7 |
| A Study of Low Temperature Diffusion Bonding Processing of TI-6AL-4V Alloy for Reducing Costs in SPF/DB Structures by J.G. Carrión | 8 |
| Paper 9 withdrawn | |
| Invited Paper New Methods for Welding Titanium and Manufacture of Unique Large-Sized Titanium Semi-Finished Products by V.N. Zamkov and V.S. Akhonin | INV1 |
| Production Methods for Titanium Aircraft Components by G. Van Den Berghe | 10 |

† Paper not available at time of production.

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Mechanical Treatments Evaluation on Ti-6Al-4V Alloy by means of XRD Residual Stress Measurement Technique | 11 |
| by F. De Paolis, C. Caroselli and S. Riscifuli | |

SESSION III: TITANIUM ALLOYS FOR BALLISTIC PROTECTION

| | |
|--|------------|
| Titanium Structures for Army Systems | KN4 |
| by W.M. Mullins | |
| Ballistic Protection Against Armour Piercing Projectiles Using Titanium Base Armour | 12 |
| by A.M. Diederer, J.P.F. Broos, S.N. van Trigt and M.C.P. Peijen | |
| A Ballistic Evaluation of Ti-6Al-4V vs. Long Rod Penetrators | 13 |
| by W.A. Gooch and M. Burkins | |
| Effect of Thermomechanical Processing on the Ballistic Performance of Titanium | 14 |
| by M. Burkins, W.A. Gooch, J. Hansen, J. Paige and P. Turner | |
| Development and Ballistic Testing of a Functionally Gradient Ceramic/Metal Applique | 15 |
| by W.A. Gooch, M.S. Burkins and R. Palicka | |

**SESSION IV: TITANIUM APPLICATION OF TITANIUM ALLOYS
IN MILITARY PLATFORMS**

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Titanium Rotors in Military Aero Engines - Designed to Weight and Life | 16 |
| by J. Broede | |
| Paper 17 withdrawn | |

SESSION V: TITANIUM APPLICATIONS IN PLATFORM SUBSYSTEMS

| | |
|--|-------------|
| Electron Beam Weld Repair and Qualification of Titanium Fan Blades for Military Gas Turbine Engines | 18 |
| by P. Azar, P. Li, P.C. Patnaik, R. Thamburaj and J-P. Immarigeon | |
| Paper 19 withdrawn | |
| Paper 20 withdrawn | |
| Titanium Desalting Mobile Equipment for Low Cost Applications | 21 |
| by A. Moriconi, S. Corradi, M. Marchetti, F. Guglielmi, M. Colavita and D. Pugliatti | |
| Invited Paper | |
| The State of the Art in Welding Metallic Composite Materials | INV2 |
| by V. Ryabov | |

Publications of the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel

MEETING PROCEEDINGS (MP)

Reduction of Military Vehicle Acquisition Time and Cost through Advanced Modelling and Virtual Simulation
MP-089, March 2003

Advanced Flow Management: Symposium Part A – Vortex Flows and High Angle of Attack for Military Vehicles / Part B – Heat Transfer and Cooling in Propulsion and Power Systems
MP-069(I), March 2003

Low Cost Composite Structures / Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms
MP-069(II), March 2003

Ageing Mechanisms and Control: Symposium Part A – Developments in Computational Aero- and Hydro-Acoustics / Part B – Monitoring and Management of Gas Turbine Fleets for Extended Life and Reduced Costs
MP-079(I), February 2003

Ageing Mechanisms and Control: Specialists' Meeting on Life Management Techniques for Ageing Air Vehicles
MP-079(II), February 2003

Unmanned Vehicles (UV) for Aerial, Ground and Naval Military Operations
MP-052, January 2002

Active Control Technology for Enhanced Performance Operational Capabilities of Military Aircraft, Land Vehicles and Sea Vehicles
MP-051, June 2001

Design for Low Cost Operation and Support
MP-37, September 2000

Gas Turbine Operation and Technology for Land, Sea and Air Propulsion and Power Systems (Unclassified)
MP-34, September 2000

Aerodynamic Design and Optimization of Flight Vehicles in a Concurrent Multi-Disciplinary Environment
MP-35, June 2000

Structural Aspects of Flexible Aircraft Control
MP-36, May 2000

New Metallic Materials for the Structure of Aging Aircraft
MP-25, April 2000

Small Rocket Motors and Gas Generators for Land, Sea and Air Launched Weapons Systems
MP-23, April 2000

Application of Damage Tolerance Principles for Improved Airworthiness of Rotorcraft
MP-24, January 2000

Gas Turbine Engine Combustion, Emissions and Alternative Fuels
MP-14, June 1999

Fatigue in the Presence of Corrosion
MP-18, March 1999

Qualification of Life Extension Schemes for Engine Components
MP-17, March 1999

Fluid Dynamics Problems of Vehicles Operation Near or in the Air-Sea Interface
MP-15, February 1999

Design Principles and Methods for Aircraft Gas Turbine Engines
MP-8, February 1999

Airframe Inspection Reliability under Field/Depot Conditions
MP-10, November 1998

Intelligent Processing of High Performance Materials
MP-9, November 1998

EDUCATIONAL NOTES (EN)

Active Control of Engine Dynamics

EN-020, November 2002

Supercavitating Flows

EN-010, January 2002

Aging Aircraft Fleets: Structural and Other Subsystem Aspects

EN-015, March 2001

Aging Engines, Avionics, Subsystems and Helicopters

EN-14, October 2000

Measurement Techniques for High Enthalpy and Plasma Flows

EN-8, April 2000

Development and Operation of UAVs for Military and Civil Applications

EN-9, April 2000

Planar Optical Measurements Methods for Gas Turbine Engine Life

EN-6, September 1999

High Order Methods for Computational Physics, Published jointly with Springer-Verlag, Germany

EN-5, March 1999

Fluid Dynamics Research on Supersonic Aircraft

EN-4, November 1998

Integrated Multidisciplinary Design of High Pressure Multistage Compressor Systems

EN-1, September 1998

TECHNICAL REPORTS (TR)

Performance Prediction and Simulation of Gas Turbine Engine Operation

TR-044, April 2002

Evaluation of Methods for Solid Propellant Burning Rate Measurements

TR-043, February 2002

Design Loads for Future Aircraft

TR-045, February 2002

Ice Accretion Simulation Evaluation Test

TR-038, November 2001

NATO East-West Workshop on Magnetic Materials for Power Applications

TR-031, August 2001

Verification and Validation Data for Computational Unsteady Aerodynamics

TR-26, October 2000

Recommended Practices for Monitoring Gas Turbine Engine Life Consumption

TR-28, April 2000

A Feasibility Study of Collaborative Multi-facility Windtunnel Testing for CFD Validation

TR-27, December 1999

Programme Committee

Low Cost Composite Structures

Chairman: Mr. D. Chaumette
Chef Etudes Générales
Direction Technique Aeronef
Dassault Aviation
78, quai Marcel Dassault
92214 St. Cloud, France
daniel.chaumette@dassault.aviation.fr

BELGIUM

Prof. Dr. J. Vantomme
Royal Military Academy (RMA)
Department of Civil Engineering
avenue de la Renaissance, 30
B-1000 Brussels
em: jvt@cobo.rma.ac.be

CANADA

Mr. A. Johnston
Institute for Aerospace Research
Structures, Materials and Propulsion Lab.
National Research Council Canada
Montreal Road
Ottawa, Ontario, K1A 0R6
em: andrew.johnston@nrc.ca

GERMANY

Dipl.- Ing. G. Guenther
European Aeronautic Defence and Space
Company GmbH
Military Aircraft, MT22
Postfach 80 11 60
81663 Munich
cm: georg.guenther@m.eads.net

Dipl.- Ing. H. Lonsinger
Daimler Benz Aerospace AG-MT2
Militaerflugzeuge
Werk Augsburg
86136 Augsburg
em: hans.lonsinger@m.eads.net

GREECE

Prof. S. Paipetis
School of Engineering
Department of Mechanical Engineering
University of Patras
26110 Patras
em: paipetis@mech.upatras.gr

ITALY

Prof. M. Marchetti
Universita "La Sapienza"
Dipartimento Aerospaziale
via Eudossiana, 16
00184 Roma
em: mario.marchetti@uniroma1.it

NORWAY

Mr. I. Sollien
Norwegian Defence Research Establishment
(FFI)
P.O. Box 25
NO-2027 Kjeller
em: ivar.sollien@ffi.no

SPAIN

Mr. F. Cabrerizo Garcia
INTA
Division de Estructuras y Materiales
Carretera de Ajalvir Km 4
28850 Torrejon de Ardoz (Madrid)
em: cabrerizogf@inta.es

TURKEY

Dr. Lt. Col. Y. Katircioglu
Ministry of National Defence (MSB)
Department of R&D (ARGE)
06650 Bakanliklar, Ankara
em: yasar@arge.msb.mil.tr

UNITED KINGDOM

Prof. M. Winstone
Structural Materials Centre
Room 2008, Griffith Building (A7)
DERA, Ively Road
Farnborough, Hampshire, GU14 0LX
em: mrwinstone@dstl.gov.uk

UNITED STATES

Dr. D. Viechnicki
US Army Re. Lab.
Weapons & Materials Research Directorate
Attn: AMSRL-WM-M
Aberdeen Proving Ground
MD 21005-5069
em: dviechn@arl.army.mil

Programme Committee

Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms

Chairman: Prof. M. Winstone
Room 2008, Griffith Building (A7)
DERA, Ively Road
Farnborough, Hampshire, GU14 0LX
em: mrwinstone@dstl.gov.uk

BELGIUM

Dr. L. Rabet
Royal Military Academy
Dept. of Civil Engineering - Materials Lab.
30 avenue de la Renaissance
1000 Brussels
em: luc.rabet@intra.rma.ac.be

Prof. Dr. J. Vantomme
Royal Military Academy (RMA)
Department of Civil Engineering
avenue de la Renaissance, 30
B-1000 Brussels
em: jvt@cobo.rma.ac.be

CANADA

Dr. J-P. Immarigeon
Institute for Aerospace Research
National Research Council of Canada
Montreal Road, Bldg. M13
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0R6

FRANCE

Mr. D. Chaumette
Direction Technique Aeronef
Dassault Aviation
78, quai Marcel Dassault
92214 St. Cloud, France
em: daniel.chaumette@dassault.aviation.fr

GERMANY

Mr. K. Woithe
IABG mbH, Abt. TA10
Einsteinstrasse, 20
D-85521 Ottobrun
em: woithe@iabg.de

ITALY

Prof. M. Marchetti
Universita "La Sapienza"
Dipartimento Aerospaziale
via Eudossiana, 16
00184 Roma
em: mario.marchetti@uniroma1.it

SPAIN

Mr. F. Cabrerizo Garcia
INTA
Division de Estructuras y Materiales
Carretera de Ajalvir Km 4
28850 Torrejon de Ardoz (Madrid)
em: cabrerizogf@inta.es

THE NETHERLANDS

Dr. Ir. A.M. Diederer
TNO Prins Maurits Laboratory
Division "Weapons & Weapon Platforms"
Research Group Munitions Effects &
Ballistic Protection
Lange Kleiweg 137 - P.O. Box 45
NL-2280 AA Rijswijk

UNITED STATES

Dr. D. Viechnicki
US Army Re. Lab.
Weapons & Materials Research Directorate
Attn: AMSRL-WM-M
Aberdeen Proving Ground
MD 21005-5069
em: dviechn@arl.army.mil

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE

| | | | |
|---|--|---|--|
| 1. Recipient's Reference | 2. Originator's References RTO-MP-069(II) AC/323(AVT-076/077)TP/47 | 3. Further Reference ISBN 92-837-0026-0 | 4. Security Classification of Document UNCLASSIFIED/ UNLIMITED |
| 5. Originator Research and Technology Organisation North Atlantic Treaty Organisation BP 25, F-92201 Neuilly-sur-Seine Cedex, France | | | |
| 6. Title Low Cost Composite Structures and Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms | | | |
| 7. Presented at/sponsored by the RTO Applied Vehicle Technology Panel (AVT) Specialists' Meeting held in Loen, Norway, 7-11 May 2001. | | | |
| 8. Author(s)/Editor(s) Multiple | | | 9. Date March 2003 |
| 10. Author's/Editor's Address Multiple | | | 11. Pages 612 (text) 20 (slides) |
| 12. Distribution Statement There are no restrictions on the distribution of this document. Information about the availability of this and other RTO unclassified publications is given on the back cover. | | | |
| 13. Keywords/Descriptors | | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Airframes Application in military systems Assessing design confidence Ballistic protection Casting Casting technology Component fabrication Composite materials Composite structures Corrosion resistance Cost Cost analysis Cost-effective Defects in castings Design | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diffusion bonding Electron beam processing Extrusion Fabrication Finite element analysis Finite element modelling Forging Fuselages Helicopters High performance composites High temperature capabilities Land vehicles Life predictions Lightweight Low cost composites | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Manufacturing Marine vehicles Mechanical properties Microstructure Microstructure/property relationship Military air platforms Military land platforms Military sea platforms Military vehicles Modelling Modelling techniques Models Performance | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Polymers Processing Qualification Reduce Reduced life cycle costs Simulation Subsystems Superplastic forming Testing Textiles Titanium alloys Titanium component Titanium extraction Weight |
| 14. Abstract | | | |
| <p>The meeting on Low Cost Composite Structures analysed the possibilities to make the use of composite materials for structures of military systems affordable. Composites are still more costly than metallic systems but they have advantages reducing the weight and consequently increasing the performance of military equipment. This included also the replacement of metallic part by composites in existing vehicles. They may also reduce maintenance cost due to their better corrosion and fatigue properties. The meeting explored recent advances in the design and manufacture of composite structures for military systems for air, sea and land vehicles. 21 papers from 11 member countries were presented and the meeting was introduced by a keynote on Cost Effective Use of Materials from Design to Disposal of Military Systems.</p> <p>The meeting on Cost Effective Application of Titanium Alloys in Military Platforms analysed major weight and performance benefits for military air, land and sea platforms due to their combination of lightweight, corrosion resistance and high temperature capabilities. Given mature processing of titanium alloys such as casting, superplastic forming and diffusion bonding, the application in military systems depends on several factors, the primary one being cost. Twenty presentations from 9 countries discussed titanium extraction, casting technology, component fabrication, use for ballistic protection, and applications in platform subsystems. Reducing costs of using titanium and its alloys in military systems depends on processing, design and manufacturing factors. Modelling can significantly contribute to better processing (reducing defects in castings, finite element modelling of processing, e.g. extrusion and forging) and to reducing testing and qualification (microstructure/property relationship, qualification of new materials, life predictions, assessing properties from a design confidence point of view). Application of new processing and design technologies is expected to reduce the cost of titanium component significantly, yielding increased performance and reduced life cycle costs.</p> | | | |

This page has been deliberately left blank



Page intentionnellement blanche



RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION

BP 25 • 7 RUE ANCELLE

F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX • FRANCE

Télécopie 0(1)55.61.22.99 • E-mail mailbox@rta.nato.int

DIFFUSION DES PUBLICATIONS

RTO NON CLASSIFIEES

L'Organisation pour la recherche et la technologie de l'OTAN (RTO), détient un stock limité de certaines de ses publications récentes, ainsi que de celles de l'ancien AGARD (Groupe consultatif pour la recherche et les réalisations aérospatiales de l'OTAN). Celles-ci pourront éventuellement être obtenues sous forme de copie papier. Pour de plus amples renseignements concernant l'achat de ces ouvrages, adressez-vous par lettre ou par télécopie à l'adresse indiquée ci-dessus. Veuillez ne pas téléphoner.

Des exemplaires supplémentaires peuvent parfois être obtenus auprès des centres nationaux de distribution indiqués ci-dessous. Si vous souhaitez recevoir toutes les publications de la RTO, ou simplement celles qui concernent certains Panels, vous pouvez demander d'être inclus sur la liste d'envoi de l'un de ces centres.

Les publications de la RTO et de l'AGARD sont en vente auprès des agences de vente indiquées ci-dessous, sous forme de photocopie ou de microfiche. Certains originaux peuvent également être obtenus auprès de CASI.

CENTRES DE DIFFUSION NATIONAUX

ALLEMAGNE

Streitkräfteamt / Abteilung III
Fachinformationszentrum der
Bundeswehr, (FIZBw)
Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 34
D-53113 Bonn

BELGIQUE

Etat-Major de la Défense
Département d'Etat-Major Stratégie
ACOS-STRAT-STE – Coord. RTO
Quartier Reine Elisabeth
Rue d'Evère, B-1140 Bruxelles

CANADA

DSIGRD2
Bibliothécaire des ressources du savoir
R et D pour la défense Canada
Ministère de la Défense nationale
305, rue Rideau, 9^e étage
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K2

DANEMARK

Danish Defence Research Establishment
Ryvangs Allé 1, P.O. Box 2715
DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø

ESPAGNE

INTA (RTO/AGARD Publications)
Carretera de Torrejón a Ajalvir, Pk.4
28850 Torrejón de Ardoz - Madrid

ETATS-UNIS

NASA Center for AeroSpace
Information (CASI)
Parkway Center
7121 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076-1320

FRANCE

O.N.E.R.A. (ISP)
29, Avenue de la Division Leclerc
BP 72, 92322 Châtillon Cedex

GRECE (Correspondant)

Defence Industry & Research
General Directorate
Research Directorate
Fakinos Base Camp
S.T.G. 1020
Holargos, Athens

HONGRIE

Department for Scientific
Analysis
Institute of Military Technology
Ministry of Defence
H-1525 Budapest P O Box 26

ISLANDE

Director of Aviation
c/o Flugrad
Reykjavik

ITALIE

Centro di Documentazione
Tecnico-Scientifica della Difesa
Via XX Settembre 123a
00187 Roma

LUXEMBOURG

Voir Belgique

NORVEGE

Norwegian Defence Research
Establishment
Attn: Biblioteket
P.O. Box 25, NO-2007 Kjeller

PAYS-BAS

Royal Netherlands Military
Academy Library
P.O. Box 90.002
4800 PA Breda

POLOGNE

Armament Policy Department
218 Niepodleglosci Av.
00-911 Warsaw

PORTUGAL

Estado Maior da Força Aérea
SDFA - Centro de Documentação
Alfragide
P-2720 Amadora

REPUBLIQUE TCHEQUE

DIC Czech Republic-NATO RTO
VTÚL a PVO Praha
Mladoboleslavská ul.
Praha 9, 197 06, Česká republika

ROYAUME-UNI

Dstl Knowledge Services
Kentigern House, Room 2246
65 Brown Street
Glasgow G2 8EX

TURQUIE

Millî Savunma Başkanlığı (MSB)
ARGE Dairesi Başkanlığı (MSB)
06650 Bakanlıklar - Ankara

AGENCES DE VENTE

NASA Center for AeroSpace
Information (CASI)

Parkway Center
7121 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076-1320
Etats-Unis

The British Library Document
Supply Centre

Boston Spa, Wetherby
West Yorkshire LS23 7BQ
Royaume-Uni

Canada Institute for Scientific and
Technical Information (CISTI)

National Research Council
Acquisitions
Montreal Road, Building M-55
Ottawa K1A 0S2, Canada

Les demandes de documents RTO ou AGARD doivent comporter la dénomination "RTO" ou "AGARD" selon le cas, suivie du numéro de série (par exemple AGARD-AG-315). Des informations analogues, telles que le titre et la date de publication sont souhaitables. Des références bibliographiques complètes ainsi que des résumés des publications RTO et AGARD figurent dans les journaux suivants:

Scientific and Technical Aerospace Reports (STAR)

STAR peut être consulté en ligne au localisateur de
ressources uniformes (URL) suivant:
<http://www.sti.nasa.gov/Pubs/star/Star.html>

STAR est édité par CASI dans le cadre du programme
NASA d'information scientifique et technique (STI)
STI Program Office, MS 157A
NASA Langley Research Center
Hampton, Virginia 23681-0001
Etats-Unis

Government Reports Announcements & Index (GRA&I)

publié par le National Technical Information Service
Springfield
Virginia 2216
Etats-Unis
(accessible également en mode interactif dans la base de
données bibliographiques en ligne du NTIS, et sur CD-ROM)





RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION

BP 25 • 7 RUE ANCELLE

F-92201 NEUILLY-SUR-SEINE CEDEX • FRANCE

Telefax 0(1)55.61.22.99 • E-mail mailbox@rta.nato.int

DISTRIBUTION OF UNCLASSIFIED

RTO PUBLICATIONS

NATO's Research and Technology Organisation (RTO) holds limited quantities of some of its recent publications and those of the former AGARD (Advisory Group for Aerospace Research & Development of NATO), and these may be available for purchase in hard copy form. For more information, write or send a telefax to the address given above. **Please do not telephone.**

Further copies are sometimes available from the National Distribution Centres listed below. If you wish to receive all RTO publications, or just those relating to one or more specific RTO Panels, they may be willing to include you (or your organisation) in their distribution.

RTO and AGARD publications may be purchased from the Sales Agencies listed below, in photocopy or microfiche form. Original copies of some publications may be available from CASI.

NATIONAL DISTRIBUTION CENTRES

BELGIUM

Etat-Major de la Défense
Département d'Etat-Major Stratégie
ACOS-STRAT-STE – Coord. RTO
Quartier Reine Elisabeth
Rue d'Evère, B-1140 Bruxelles

CANADA

DRDKIM2
Knowledge Resources Librarian
Defence R&D Canada
Department of National Defence
305 Rideau Street, 9th Floor
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K2

CZECH REPUBLIC

DIC Czech Republic-NATO RTO
VTÚL a PVO Praha
Mladoboleslavská ul.
Praha 9, 197 06, Česká republika

DENMARK

Danish Defence Research
Establishment
Ryvangs Allé 1, P.O. Box 2715
DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø

FRANCE

O.N.E.R.A. (ISP)
29 Avenue de la Division Leclerc
BP 72, 92322 Châtillon Cedex

GERMANY

Streitkräfteamt / Abteilung III
Fachinformationszentrum der
Bundeswehr, (FIZBw)
Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 34
D-53113 Bonn

GREECE (Point of Contact)

Defence Industry & Research
General Directorate
Research Directorate
Fakinos Base Camp
S.T.G. 1020
Holargos, Athens

HUNGARY

Department for Scientific
Analysis
Institute of Military Technology
Ministry of Defence
H-1525 Budapest P O Box 26

ICELAND

Director of Aviation
c/o Flugrad
Reykjavik

ITALY

Centro di Documentazione
Tecnico-Scientifica della Difesa
Via XX Settembre 123a
00187 Roma

LUXEMBOURG

See Belgium

NETHERLANDS

Royal Netherlands Military
Academy Library
P.O. Box 90.002
4800 PA Breda

NORWAY

Norwegian Defence Research
Establishment
Attn: Biblioteket
P.O. Box 25, NO-2007 Kjeller

POLAND

Armament Policy Department
218 Niepodleglosci Av.
00-911 Warsaw

PORTUGAL

Estado Maior da Força Aérea
SDFA - Centro de Documentação
Alfragide
P-2720 Amadora

SPAIN

INTA (RTO/AGARD Publications)
Carretera de Torrejón a Ajalvir, Pk.4
28850 Torrejón de Ardoz - Madrid

TURKEY

Millî Savunma Başkanlığı (MSB)
ARGE Dairesi Başkanlığı (MSB)
06650 Bakanliklar - Ankara

UNITED KINGDOM

Dstl Knowledge Services
Kentigern House, Room 2246
65 Brown Street
Glasgow G2 8EX

UNITED STATES

NASA Center for AeroSpace
Information (CASI)
Parkway Center
7121 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076-1320

SALES AGENCIES

NASA Center for AeroSpace
Information (CASI)

Parkway Center
7121 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076-1320
United States

The British Library Document
Supply Centre

Boston Spa, Wetherby
West Yorkshire LS23 7BQ
United Kingdom

Canada Institute for Scientific and
Technical Information (CISTI)

National Research Council
Acquisitions
Montreal Road, Building M-55
Ottawa K1A 0S2, Canada

Requests for RTO or AGARD documents should include the word 'RTO' or 'AGARD', as appropriate, followed by the serial number (for example AGARD-AG-315). Collateral information such as title and publication date is desirable. Full bibliographical references and abstracts of RTO and AGARD publications are given in the following journals:

Scientific and Technical Aerospace Reports (STAR)

STAR is available on-line at the following uniform resource locator:

<http://www.sti.nasa.gov/Pubs/star/Star.html>

STAR is published by CASI for the NASA Scientific and Technical Information (STI) Program
STI Program Office, MS 157A
NASA Langley Research Center
Hampton, Virginia 23681-0001
United States

Government Reports Announcements & Index (GRA&I)

published by the National Technical Information Service
Springfield
Virginia 22161
United States
(also available online in the NTIS Bibliographic Database or on CD-ROM)



Printed by St. Joseph Print Group Inc.
(A St. Joseph Corporation Company)

1165 Kenaston Street, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1G 6S1